

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9

**CITY OF SIERRA MADRE
PLANNING COMMISSION MINUTES**

Regular Meeting of
Thursday, July 18, 2019 at 7:00 p.m.
City Council Chambers, 232 W. Sierra Madre Blvd.

10
11
12
13

CALL TO ORDER

Chair Hutt called the meeting to order at 7:01 P.M.

14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23

ROLL CALL

Present: Chair Hutt, Commissioners Desai, Catalano, Pevsner

Absent: Vice Chair Denison, Commissioner Spears

Staff: Vincent Gonzalez, Director of Planning and Community Preservation
Clare Lin, Associate Planner
Jennifer Peterson, Administrative Analyst
Joshua Wolf, Assistant Planner
Theresa Highsmith, City Attorney.

24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33

APPROVAL OF AGENDA

Commissioner Catalano moved to approve the agenda. Commissioner Desai seconded. Motion carried unanimously.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF JUNE 20, 2019

Commissioner Desai moved to approve the minutes. Commissioner Pevsner seconded. Motion carried unanimously.

34
35
36
37
38
39

AUDIENCE COMMENTS

None.

PUBLIC HEARING

40
41
42
43

**1. HILLSIDE DEVELOPMENT PERMIT #15-01 (HDP 15-01) and CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT #15-01 (CUP 15-01)
Address: 15 Nathaniel Terrace**

44
45
46

Associate Planner Lin delivered the Staff Report and Power Point Presentation.

Mr. Garcia

47 Architect of Record
48 Mr. Garcia delivered a Power Point Presentation.

49
50 The Commission discussed design concerns, to which Mr. Garcia provided clarification.

51
52 Sarah Jane Harmon
53 Baldwin Ct.
54 Ms. Harmon spoke against the project, and voiced concerns about the design in context
55 of the setting, the amount of glass in the design, and the bulk and massing.

56
57 Deb Sheridan
58 Valle Vista Dr.
59 Ms. Sheridan spoke against the project. She had concerns about the lack of a geo-
60 technical report, the floor area ratio in relation to the lot size, and the amount of glass in
61 the design. She also pointed out water usage concerns, and that the public has limited
62 access to the lot, due to the locked gate.

63
64 Diane Scalzo
65 Baldwin Ave.
66 Ms. Scalzo indicated that she could not see the home; however, was concerned about
67 the size. She requested to see the addresses of the top 1/3 largest homes within the
68 notification radius.

69
70 Greg Harmon
71 Baldwin Ct.
72 Mr. Harmon was concerned with the lack of notification and access to the site. He
73 suggested that the notice be provided earlier and larger.

74
75 Chair Hutt requested that future noticing include a large sign board at both locations.
76 He also requested that the applicant remove sign at the site of the previously approved
77 project.

78
79 Commissioner Catalano noted that the Commission had received two letters and he
80 wanted to address concerns raised in them and to enter them into record.

81
82 Richard McDonald
83 Mr. McDonald requested copies of the submitted letters.

84
85 **Discussion**

86
87 Commissioner Desai had concerns with the roof shape, and the relation of the roof to
88 the surrounding hillside. He suggested utilizing a butterfly roof design and noted that
89 that the underside of the roof should be treated as a prominent architectural feature of
90 the house due to its visibility. Suggested to push second story mass toward the north
91 with cantilever edge. Consider relocating south elevation chimney which is obstructing
92 views from the deck. Single-story with terminating wall is troublesome. Consider a

93 darker color material pallet to blend with the hillside setting. The design should
94 incorporate more glazing on southeast face of the building; however reflectivity is of
95 concern. Utilize clear glass in lieu of Low-E glazing with reflective coating. Consider
96 raising sill height along southeast face of building to create a more horizontal view/
97 panorama when viewed from interior spaces.
98

99 Commissioner Pevsner felt that the massing was not articulated, the design was too
100 busy and does not capitalize views. The design appears to be indoor program driven.
101 The house should be tucked in with more emphasis placed on the roof. Shared access
102 road is of concern. The basement does not solve issue of reducing bulk and mass.
103 Need to move program of the house underground.
104

105 Commissioner Catalano also was concerned that light colored stucco will increase
106 visibility. He noted that a butterfly roof design would provide better visual interest. He
107 also felt that the Geology and emergency access to the subterranean courtyard is of
108 concern and should be addressed.
109

110 Director Gonzalez clarified that geotechnical and fire code compliance is not under the
111 purview of the Commission.
112

113 Chair Hutt stated that he does not have any issues with the conditional use permit
114 findings. He did have concerns that the proposed design was sited such that it
115 increased the appearance of bulk and mass. He noted that this house lends itself to a
116 single-story design. He felt that the design should keep one-story to the south and push
117 the second story approximately 15 feet to the north against the north setback. He
118 indicated that the Commission has the ability to modify setback requirements which may
119 be addressed in the design review findings. Expressed concern with 13-foot tall
120 retaining wall in sunken-courtyard—the space is void of plant material which could be
121 utilized to minimize the impact of the wall when viewed from interior spaces. He
122 suggested to move the basement program to the east. Commissioner Hutt also
123 directed the applicant to verify the width of the County access road.
124

125 Mr. Garcia felt that the applicants have sufficient information and direction to return with
126 a revised design.
127

128 **ACTION: Commissioner Catalano moved to continue this item to Sept 19, 2019.**
129 **Commissioner Desai seconded. Motion carried unanimously.**
130

131 **ORAL COMMUNICATION**
132

133 **Planning Commission Reports**
134

135 Commissioner Catalano reported that the subcommittee for the 638 Baldwin project had
136 approved all items and had been sent back to staff.
137

138 Commissioner Catalano inquired about the status of the Commission vacancy. Director
139 Gonzalez stated that City Council is waiting for another application.

140
141 Commissioner Catalano announced the rental of Richardson House to the Historic
142 Commission.

143

144 **Staff**

145

146 Director Gonzalez stated that he will be meeting with Chair Hutt and Vice Chair Denison
147 for a Commercial Zone subcommittee meeting on Monday.

148

149 Director Gonzalez stated that the next Planning Commission meeting is scheduled for
150 August 1, 2019.

151

152 Commissioner Desai stated that he will not be able to attend the meeting on August 1st.

153

154 Chair Hutt adjourned the meeting at 8:53 P.M.

155

156

157

158

159

160



161

Secretary to the Planning Commission

162

Vincent Gonzalez, Director of Planning & Community Preservation

163

164